

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

The Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington met at St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener, on Tuesday, March 8, 2016 for the regular meeting of Presbytery. Refreshments were served at 6:30 p.m. and the meeting constituted at 7:00 p.m.

### **WORSHIP**

Worship was conducted by Lisa Brimblecome, a graduating student from Knox College and certified by the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington. The organist was Douglas Haas, organist at St. Andrew's, Kitchener.

### **PRESENTATION BY PHILIP McFIE**

The presbytery was requested by Justice Ministries of the Life and Mission Agency of the PCC to have Philip McFie, the Presbyterian student intern for Project Ploughshares from Parkside Presbyterian Church in Ottawa speak to the Presbytery. Philip was introduced by the Rev. Mike Burns on behalf of the EIF Committee. The Moderator expressed appreciation to Philip for his presentation.

### **CONSTITUTION OF THE COURT AND WELCOME**

The Rev. Brooke Ashfield, Moderator, opened the meeting with prayer and constituted the court.

He welcomed all visitors in attendance.

He expressed appreciation to the congregation of St. Andrew's, Kitchener for their welcome and hospitality.

### **ATTENDANCE:**

**Ministers** - Rev. Brooke Ashfield (Moderator), Rev. Linda Ashfield, Rev. John Borthwick, Rev. Mike Burns, Rev. Edward Charlton, Rev. Chris Ji Hoon, Rev. Darrell Clarke, Rev. Mark Gaskin, Rev. Dr. Mark Lewis, Rev. Alex MacLeod, Rev. Scott McAndless, Rev. Kathy Morden, Rev. Johan Olivier, Rev. John Paeng, Rev. Mark Richardson, Rev. Greg Smith, Rev. Glen Soderholm, Rev. Frank Szatmari, Rev. David Whitecross, Rev. Amanda Wickenheiser, Rev. Karla Wübbenhorst.

**Representative Elders** – Junghee Ahn, Carolyn Boyne, Allison Cann, Bob Cooper, Janet deGroot, Andrew Foster, Judith Harrison, Marion Hunter, Alan Israel, Frank Kivell, Joan Knox, Alex McNabb, Peggy Lennox, Gib McIlwrath, David Ogram, Bob Renton, Ross Rowat, Robert Seim, Jim Zaryski

**Alternate Representative Elders** - Helen Cleghorn, Candace Delane, Erik Kabbes, Rick Thomas

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

**Appendix to the Roll** - Rev. Dr. Linda Bell, Rev. Calvin Brown, Rev. Angus Sutherland

**Students** - Lisa Brimblecome

**W.M.S** - Jean Godin

**Treasurer** - Allan Stewart

**Clerk** - Dr. Wilma Welsh

**Students** - Lisa Brimblecome

**Visitors:** Liz Taylor-Samis, Philip McFie

**REGRETS:**

**Ministers** – Rev. Susan Clarke, Rev. Scott Sinclair

**Representative Elder** - Lydia Maitland, Walter MacNeill

**Ministers on the Appendix to the Roll** - Rev. Dr. Linda Bell, Rev. Dr. Walter McLean, Rev. Angus McGillivray

**APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED AGENDA**

Moved by John Paeng/Gib McIlwrath that the proposed agenda be adopted. CARRIED.

**WELCOME**

The Moderator welcomed three new representative elders – Carolyn Boyne (Gale, Elmira), Joan Knox (Kortright, Guelph) and Bob Cooper (St. Andrew's, Fergus). The Rev. Greg Smith was also welcomed to his first presbytery meeting as a member of the constituent roll.

**DEATH IN THE MINISTRY**

The Clerk had just been advised of the death of the Rev. David Ketchen of Guelph. He was transferred to the Roll of Waterloo-Wellington in February 2016 at the request of the Presbytery of Paris. The Clerk read the following brief biography,

David graduated from Fergus High School in 1957 and secured a position with Trull Funeral Homes in Toronto as an apprentice funeral director and embalmer. In 1961, sensing a strong calling to Christian ministry, he enrolled at Waterloo Lutheran University (now Wilfred Laurier) and graduated with a B.A. He further pursued his theological studies at Westminster Seminary in Philadelphia, PA, USA. During his final year he married Evelyn Root and together they have three sons; Jonathan, Michael, and Stephen. David and Evelyn have ministered to five congregations:- Cranberry Portage in northern Manitoba; Innerkip, Ontario; Sydney, Nova Scotia; Duanesburg, New York, and Valparaiso, Indiana. Upon returning to Canada he served as

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

pulpit supply in several churches in Southern Ontario. Until his passing on February 26, 2016, he and Evelyn resided in Guelph, Ontario

The Clerk recorded the following obituary found on the Funeral Home website.

**KETCHEN, Rev. David Roland -**

At Guelph General Hospital, with his wife of 49 years by his side, passed peacefully to Heaven on February 26th, 2016 in his 79th year.

Cherished husband of Evelyn (nee Root); beloved father of Jonathan (Guelph), Michael (Nancy)(Scotia NY) and Stephen James (Schenectady, NY); dear grandfather of Stephen Patrick, Leah, Colin, Micaelyn, Margaret, Sean and Scott.

Brother-in-law of Marie Root (1936), Bennett (2016) and Diana Root, George (Ann d., Leita) Root, Robert (Barbara) Root and Clayton (Charlene) Root. Loved son of Roland (1987) and Jean (1976) and Step-mother Ruth (2009).

David was an appreciated pastor to several Presbyterian churches in Canada and the USA for over 40 years. His leisure time hobbies were reading, doing daily crossword puzzles and making many quilts for his family and friends.

A celebration of David's life was held at **St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church**, Fergus on March 19th, 2016.

Memorial contributions may be made to St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church in Fergus, The Foundation of The Guelph General Hospital, The Multiple Sclerosis Society or the charity of your choice.

It was agreed to send this memorial to the General Assembly for inclusion in the Acts and Proceedings. The Moderator led the court in prayer for the family and friends of the Rev. David Ketchen.

**MINUTES**

Moved by Mark Richardson/Andrew Foster that the following minutes be approved as circulated with a small correction.

January 26, 2016 – Call sustained to Greg Smith

February 2, 2016 – regular meeting of presbytery

February 14, 2016 – Ordination and Induction of the Rev. Greg Smith

CARRIED

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
 Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
 St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

## REPORTS

**BUSINESS COMMITTEE** – presented by Wilma Welsh, Clerk – see Appendix “A”

1. Recommendation - Moved by Alex MacLeod/Ross Rowat that the actions of the Business Committee in assigning the correspondence be homologated. CARRIED

2. **Special Committee**

Correspondence - Business Committee action – re Two Complaints received

16-021 Rev. K. Wübbenhorst – signed copy of complaint

16-022 Rev. A. MacLeod – signed copy of complaint

### Complaint received

To the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington

We, the undersigned, hereby register a complaint against the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington for its decision in the following matter: the request of the session of Westminster-St. Paul's church that its overture re: Indigenous Spirituality be transmitted to the General Assembly and referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine, which request was denied by the Presbytery on amended motion not to receive and consider the overture. We believe that the Presbytery mistook a theological point at issue for disrespect and erred by impeding the legitimate access of a lower court to the General Assembly. The relief requested is that the Presbytery transmit the overture as it deems best: with approval, without comment or with disapproval, and that the overture be referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine, since the overture would have made the deadline for referred overtures, had it been approved for transmission on the date when Presbytery met. We therefore ask you to take such steps as will correct this matter and resolve it for the health and welfare of the church and the glory of God. Signed by the Rev. Karla A Wübbenhorst and the Rev. Alex N. MacLeod.

The Moderator appointed a Special Committee to meet with the two complainants as required by the Book of Forms. The Committee named – Rev. Scott McAndless (Convener); Rev. Brooke Ashfield, Rev. Johan Olivier, and Dr. Wilma Welsh.

Recommendation

Moved by Mark Lewis/Kathy Morden that the actions of the Moderator in appointing a special committee be homologated. CARRIED

**Report of the Special Committee to deal with a Corrective Case** - see Appendix “B”

Moved by Scott McAndless/Mark Lewis that the Report of the Special Committee be received and considered. CARRIED.

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

**Special Committee Report** – presented by the Rev. Scott McAndless

The following report was received from the Special Committee to deal with the complaint

**Request #1:** That a notice of Motion be received that at a future sederunt I will move or cause to be moved that the presbytery reconsider its motion of February 2: "that the overture not be received."

**Notice of Motion**

Received by the Rev. Dr. Mark Lewis:

At a future sederunt I will move or cause to be moved that the presbytery reconsider its motion of February 2 'that the overture not be received.

**Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by Greg Smith/Andrew Foster that the court adjourn for five minutes and reconstitute as a meeting of the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington. CARRIED

The Moderator closed the meeting with prayer announcing that the presbytery would constitute as a new meeting of the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington in five minutes

---

Rev. Brooke Ashfield, Moderator

---

Dr. Wilma Welsh, Clerk

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
 Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
 St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

## Appendix "A"

**BUSINESS COMMITTEE****CORRESPONDENCE – January 12/16-March 8, 2016**

16-005	Rev. Wayne Hancock – requesting presentation to Presbytery	Mission & Outreach
16-006	PCCConnect – January Edition	all Presbyters
16-007	PWS&D – January E Newsletter	all Presbyters
16-008	Rev. Brooke Ashfield – Request for funding for Syrian Refugees	Mission & Outreach
16-009	Rev. Scott Sinclair – Proposal for 2017 Inter-Mission	Ministry Committee
16-010	Session Westminster-St. Paul's – Overture with request to Transmit to the General Assembly without comment	rec'd at Feb. 2 presbytery meeting
16-011	Rev. John Borthwick – Report on 2015 Continuing Educ.	Ministry Committee
16-012	J. Bell – Rural and Remote Student Grants	all presbyters
16-013	ICC Upcoming Events	all presbyters
16-014	PCCConnect – February Edition	all presbyters
16-015	OISE = New Course for Non-Profits & Coops as a Workplace	all presbyters
16-016	Rev. Glen Soderholm – copy of email to Jen Bell re relationship of WW Presbytery to Two Rivers	clerk's files
16-017	Rev. D. Clarke – re refugee support from presbytery	Mission & Outreach
16-018	Rev. E. Charlton- re 4 groups requesting support from Presbytery	Mission & Outreach
16-019	R. McRonald – St. Andrew's, Guelph re refugee support from presbytery	Mission & Outreach
16-020	J. Czegledi – Education & Reception – Competent Objection by Presbyteries to Applications received	all presbyters
16-021	Rev. K. Wübbenhorst – signed copy of complaint	Business Committee
16-022	Rev. A. MacLeod – signed copy of complaint	Business Committee
16-023	Rev. S. Sinclair – copy of Minutes of Ministry Committee	clerk's files
16-024	Rev. J. Borthwick – advising that Session of St. Andrew's, Guelph approved his 2017 intermission	Ministry Committee
16-025	TL Hamilton – acknowledgement of List of Commissioners	clerk's files
16-026	PWS&D Newsletter – February E-Newsletter	all presbyters
16-027	TL Hamilton – acknowledgement of Nominations to General Assembly committees	clerk's files
16-028	Susan Shaffer – acknowledgement of Diane Boyd's endorsement to Education and Reception	clerk's files
16-029	Mary Nunn – acknowledging with thanks the recognition of her father's passing – Rev. Walter Allum	clerk's files
16-030	Presbyterian College – cc of letter to David Sturtevant advising that he will complete requirements and graduate in May 2016	Ministry Committee

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

1. Recommendation

That the actions of the Business Committee in assigning the correspondence be homologated.

2. Correspondence - requiring Business Committee action

16-021 Rev. K. Wübbenhorst – signed copy of complaint  
16-022 Rev. A. MacLeod – signed copy of complaint

The Moderator appointed a Special Committee to meet with the two complainants as required by the Book of Forms. The Committee named – Rev. Scott McAndless (Convener); Rev. Brooke Ashfield, Rev. Johan Olivier, and Dr. Wilma Welsh.

Recommendation

That the actions of the Moderator in appointing a special committee be homologated.

3. **Minutes due for attestation**

Joonim, Kitchener-Waterloo

4. **Future Presbytery Meetings**

May 10, 2016 –Mount Forest – Presbytery constituted at 7:00 p.m.  
dinner to be at 6:00 p.m., cost \$15.00 (salad, meat, potatoes, veggie with pie for dessert)  
- advise clerk by May 3rd if you plan to attend the dinner  
June 21, 2016 –Kortright Guelph  
September 13, 2016 (new Moderator's church)

5. **Commissioners to 2016 General Assembly – list complete**

**Ministers -**

Rev. Mark Gaskin (leader), Rev. Chris Ji Hoon Cho, Rev. John Paeng, Rev. Kathy Morden,  
Rev. David Whitecross

**Elders**

Knox Preston, Cambridge (Candace Delane), Knox, Waterloo (David Ogram), Gale, Elmira  
(Sarah Bradshaw); St. Andrew's, Kitchener (Janet MacDowell); Doon, Kitchener (Tom  
Vanderstelt)

Recommendation

That the above named ministers and elders be named as commissioners from the  
Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington to the 142<sup>nd</sup> General Assembly.

Wilma Welsh, Clerk ([clerkwatwell@gmail.com](mailto:clerkwatwell@gmail.com))

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

Note to Commissioners – Commissioning will be held on Tuesday, May 10<sup>th</sup> at the regular meeting of the Presbytery – Kortright Church , Guelph at 7:00 p.m.

6. Moderator's Ballots must be received by the Clerk no later than March 15<sup>th</sup>, 2016 – if new representative elders did not receive ballots from previous representative elder, please see the Clerk.
  
7. Reminder – Statistical Reports were due March 1<sup>st</sup>.

Wilma Welsh,  
Clerk



Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
 Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
 St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

Appendix "B"

**Report of the Special Committee to Deal with a Corrective Case**

March 8, 2016

On February 2, 2016, the Presbytery conducted the following business (as recorded in the minutes):

***Overture from the Session of Westminster-St. Paul's Presbyterian Church***

*– see Appendix "H" (February 2, 2016 meeting)*

*An unsigned Overture received by the Clerk on Sunday, January 31, 2016, approved by the Session at a special Session meeting held after worship on Sunday, January 31, 2016.*

*The Session requested that the Overture be submitted without comment.*

*Moved by Grant Scott/Johan Olivier that the Overture be received.*

*Amendment*

*Moved by John Borthwick/Mark Lewis that the motion be amended to read – That the overture "not be received".*

*Amendment Carried*

*Motion as Amended – CARRIED*

The Presbytery has since received the following complaint by two of its members alleging that the Presbytery did not follow proper procedure in these actions:

To the Presbytery of Waterloo Wellington

We, the undersigned, hereby register a complaint against the Presbytery of Waterloo Wellington for its decision in the following matter: the request of the session of Westminster-St. Paul's church that its overture re: Indigenous Spirituality be transmitted to the General Assembly and referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine, which request was denied by the Presbytery on amended motion not to receive and consider the overture. We believe that the Presbytery mistook a theological point at issue for disrespect and erred by impeding the legitimate access of a lower court to the General Assembly. The relief requested is that the Presbytery transmit the overture as it deems best: with approval, without comment or with disapproval, and that the overture be referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine, since the overture would have made the deadline for referred overtures, had it been approved for transmission on the date when Presbytery met. We therefore ask you to take such steps as will correct this matter and resolve it for the health and welfare of the church and the glory of God.

Signed by the Rev. Karla A. Wübbenhorst and the Rev. Alex N. MacLeod

The Business Committee deemed that the complaint was in good order and that it was received within the prescribed time. The complaint triggers a procedure known as a **Corrective Case**

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
 Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
 St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

which is found in the Book of Forms 381-392. We would recommend that Presbyters read over this section of the Book of Forms to familiarize themselves with this process.

A Corrective Case requires that the Presbytery must take a number of key actions within 60 days of receiving the complaint. That deadline is April 12, 2016.

First the Presbytery must form a committee to meet with the complainants and "determine if a resolution can be reached on the matter without recourse to further process." This present committee was formed to do this. A meeting was held with Karla Wübbenhorst on March 3, and with Alex MacLeod on March 8. At this meeting, it was proposed that the Presbytery could put together an alternative process for dealing with concerns raised in the overture and bringing them before the General Assembly in a way that the whole Presbytery could feel comfortable with. This idea was rejected as not dealing with the matters at the level that they need to be dealt with. The complainants have made it clear that only the following actions by the presbytery would give them the relief that they are seeking.

1. That the Presbytery agree to reconsider the amended motion that was carried at the February 2 meeting.
2. That the Presbytery agree to amend the original motion so that it read, "that the overture be received and sent onto General Assembly and referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine." They do not care whether the overture be sent on with approval, without comment or with disapproval.
3. That the Presbytery add a note indicating that if the overture had been sent on when the Presbytery acted improperly, it would have been in time for the received overtures to be considered at the 2016 General Assembly and asking that consideration be expedited if possible.

The committee would like Presbytery to understand that while, in a corrective case, Presbytery must at the very least decide whether or not it wants to reconsider the original motion, Presbytery must freely choose its own course of action beyond that. No one can oblige Presbytery to take a specific action. Presbytery is advised, however, that if it does not grant the relief requested, the case will likely be sent on to the 2016 General Assembly. The General Assembly will necessarily only be concerned with the question of whether or not everyone involved correctly followed our procedures. Any theological, doctrinal or ministry issues raised by the original overture will be lost until the corrective case has run its course. Only the complainants can stop the corrective case from proceeding by choosing to withdraw their complaint.

The committee therefore recommends the following course of action to the Presbytery:

- That we discern whether it is the will of Presbytery to reconsider its original action. In order to reconsider that action, we will need someone to give notice of motion that "at a future sederunt they will move or cause to be moved that the presbytery reconsider its motion of February 2: 'that the overture not be received' be reconsidered." Please note

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
 Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
 St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

that the motion to reconsider can only be made and seconded by people who voted with the majority at the meeting. We humbly ask presbyters who are in that position to consider giving such notice of motion and making such a motion.

- **If** notice of motion is received, that the presbytery move to adjourn for a short length of time defined by the moderator.
- That the presbytery be constituted once again in prayer.
- That the Presbytery pass the motion to reconsider (notice having been duly given, moved and seconded by people who voted with the majority).
- **If** the motion to reconsider is approved, that the Presbytery amend the motion until it reads something like what follows: "that the overture be received and sent with the approval of the Presbytery (**or** without comment **or** with the disapproval of Presbytery) onto General Assembly and referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine."
- **If** the motion is amended and approved as above, that an additional motion be approved, "That the Clerk of Presbytery add a note indicating that if the overture had been sent on when the Presbytery acted improperly, it would have been in time for the referred overtures to be considered at the 2016 General Assembly and asking that consideration be expedited if possible."

Again, the committee is not telling the Presbytery that it *must* do these things, only informing it that, if it does otherwise, a corrective case will likely be sent to the General Assembly. We are likewise not stating that the Presbytery acted improperly, only inviting the presbytery to consider whether its procedures were correct. We commend ourselves to the wisdom of the Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington.

Here, for easy reference, are the requests and recommendations of the committee:

**Request #1:** That a notice of Motion be given: "at a future sederunt I will move or cause to be moved that the presbytery reconsider its motion of February 2: 'that the overture not be received.'"

**Recommendation #1:** That the court be adjourned until recalled by the moderator.

Following Reconstitution:

**Recommendation #2:** That the Presbytery reconsider its motion of February 2: "That the overture not be received." (Moved and seconded by persons who voted with the majority)

**Recommendation #3:** That the original motion be amended to read something like, "that the overture be received and sent with the approval of the Presbytery (**or** without comment **or** with the disapproval of Presbytery) onto General Assembly and referred to the Committee on Church Doctrine."

**Recommendation #4:** That the newly amended motion be adopted.

**Recommendation #5:** That the Clerk of Presbytery add a note indicating that, if the overture had been sent on when the Presbytery acted improperly, it would

Presbytery of Waterloo-Wellington  
Regular Meeting, March 8, 2016, at 7:00 p.m.  
St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kitchener

have been in time for the referred overtures to be considered at the 2016  
General Assembly and asking that consideration be expedited if possible.  
Or that the Presbytery, in its wisdom, do otherwise.

Respectfully submitted,  
Scott McAndless, Convenor.